

# AMO's 2011 Municipal Insurance Survey Results

Managing the Cost of Risk

August 23, 2011

Association of Municipalities of Ontario

200 University Avenue, Suite 801 Toronto, ON M5H 3C6 Canada Tel: 416-971-9856 ● Fax: 416-971-6191

email: <a href="mailto:amo@amo.on.ca">amo@amo.on.ca</a> website: www.amo.on.ca

#### **AMO's 2011 Municipal Insurance Survey Results**

The Association of Municipalities of Ontario has completed the first ever comprehensive survey of municipal insurance costs across the province. The survey reveals that since 2007, liability premiums have increased by 22.2% and are among the fastest growing municipal costs. Total 2011 Ontario municipal insurance costs are \$155.2 million. Liability premiums make up the majority of these expenses at \$85.5 million. Property taxpayers are paying this price.

Insurance costs exceed annual province-wide municipal spending in each of these respective areas: maintaining bridges and culverts, administering and providing Ontario Works employment assistance benefits, and funding Conservation Authorities.

These costs disproportionately affect small municipalities. The per capita insurance costs for communities with populations under 10,000 are \$37.56. By comparison, per capita costs in large communities with populations over 75,000 are \$7.71. Property taxpayers in one northern community are spending more on insurance than their library. In one southern county, for every \$2 spent on snowplowing roads, another \$1 is spent on insurance.

The survey was prompted by anecdotal reports of rising insurance costs. It sought to quantify, in part, some of the costs associated with joint and several liability in the provincial *Negligence Act*. It does not include legal fees, self-insurance costs, settlements, risk management expenses or court mandated awards. Based on current trends, insurance costs will rise to \$214 million annually by 2020.

The insurance premiums paid by municipalities reflect the legal reality that municipalities are "deep pocket" defendants, often targeted for litigation because the law has established such a low threshold of responsibility. Just a fraction of fault can cost a municipality millions of dollars. The premiums charged by insurance companies, non-profit insurance reciprocals and pools reflect, in part, this legal risk.

Continued advocacy by municipalities is needed to help change this legal environment and explore alternatives such as proportionate liability. Many common law jurisdictions have pursued proportionate liability in the face of rising costs and this unequitable burden. AMO looks forward to discussing these pressing municipal issues with the next government.

Please see the back of this booklet for tips on managing your municipal premiums.



200 University Ave, Suite 801 Toronto, ON M5H 3C6 Tel.: (416) 971-9856 | Fax: (416) 971-6191

E-mail: amo@amo.on.ca

### **Municipal Insurance Survey Results**

Survey Results for 2011 <sup>1</sup>	All Municipalities		
Total Insurance Costs <sup>2</sup>			
Average Annual Insurance Premium for 2011	\$378,589		
Total Insurance Costs for 2011	\$155,221,422		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 20.8%		
Liability Insurance <sup>3</sup>			
Avg. Annual General Liability Insurance Premium for 2011	\$208,767		
Total Premium Costs for 2011	\$85,594,449		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 22.2%		
Avg. Per Occurrence Deductible	\$108,583		
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 2.4%		
Avg. Total Annual Dollar Limit of Coverage	\$27,327,876		
Property Insurance <sup>4</sup>			
Avg. Annual Property Insurance Premium for 2011	\$82,774		
Total Premium Costs for 2011	\$33,937,189		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 16%		
Avg. Annual Deductible	\$46,882		
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 2.8%		
Avg. Total Value Insured	\$162,501,159		
Automobile Insurance			
Avg. Auto Insurance Premium for 2011	\$78,812		
Total Premium Costs for 2011	\$32,312,881		
Avg. % Change in Premiums from 2007	Up 21.2%		
Avg. Annual Auto Insurance Deductible	\$42,085		
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 3.6%		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> All results have been weighted from a sample size of between 97 and 122 municipalities representing approximately 50% of the Ontario population. With a 95% confidence limit, the results are accurate to within +/-7.42%. Premiums vary based on individual municipal claims history.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Premiums include all coverage from general liability, property and automobile insurance plus other coverage, including other liability insurance as well as environmental, transit, crime, aviation, and marine insurance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Includes coverage for annual aggregate commercial or comprehensive general liability insurance (including primary, umbrella and excess layers).

<sup>4</sup> Deductible includes coverage for boiler and machinery.



### **Small Municipalities with Population** under 9,999

Survey Results for 2011 <sup>1</sup>	Municipalities with a population of 1-5,000	Municipalities with a population of 5,001-9,999	
Total Insurance Costs <sup>2</sup>			
Average Annual Insurance Premiums for 2011	\$98,757	\$189,765	
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 13.4%	Up 15%	
Liability Insurance <sup>3</sup>			
Avg. General Liability Insurance Premiums for 2011	\$68,680	\$120,780	
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 20.0%	Up 8.2%	
Avg. Per Occurrence Deductible	\$6,667	\$9,808	
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 2.6%	Up 7.4%	
Avg. Total Annual Dollar Limit of Coverage	\$22,203,125	\$21,730,769	
	Property Insurance⁴		
Avg. Annual Property Insurance Premium for 2011	\$26,920	\$44,932	
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 2.8%	Up 26.7%	
Avg. Total Value Insured	\$22,497,108	\$44,661,275	
Avg. Annual Deductible	\$8,393	\$6,944	
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 2.2%	Up 4.2%	
Automobile Insurance			
Avg. Auto Insurance Premium for 2011	\$19,476	\$28,330	
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 21%	Up 8.8%	
Avg. Annual Auto Insurance Deductible	\$4,192	\$5,019	
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 19.8%	Up 5.9%	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> All results have been weighted from a sample size of between 97 and 122 municipalities representing approximately 50% of the Ontario population. With a 95% confidence limit, the results are accurate to within +/-7.42%. Premiums vary based on individual municipal claims history.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Premiums include all coverage from general liability, property and automobile insurance plus other coverage, including other liability insurance as well as environmental, transit, crime, aviation, and marine insurance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Includes coverage for annual aggregate commercial or comprehensive general liability insurance (including primary, umbrella and excess layers).

<sup>4</sup> Deductible includes coverage for boiler and machinery.



200 University Ave, Suite 801 Toronto, ON M5H 3C6 Tel.: (416) 971-9856 | Fax: (416) 971-6191

E-mail: amo@amo.on.ca

## Medium Municipalities with Population of 10,000-74,999

Survey Results for 2011 <sup>1</sup>	Municipalities with a population of 10,000-42,500	Municipalities with a population of 42,501- 74,999		
Total Insurance Costs <sup>2</sup>				
Average Annual Insurance Premiums for 2011	\$375,666	\$895,023		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 25.4%	Up 8.6%		
Liability Insurance <sup>3</sup>				
Avg. Annual General Liability Insurance Premiums for 2011	\$241,006	\$535,810		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 34.9%	Up 5.3%		
Avg. Per Occurrence Deductible	\$14,167	\$41,500		
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 10.1%	Up 105.3% <sup>*</sup>		
Avg. Total Annual Dollar Limit of Coverage	\$33,335,185	\$41,428,571		
Property Insurance <sup>4</sup>				
Avg. Annual Property Insurance Premium for 2011	\$76,405	\$170,315		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 19.7%	Up 5.1%		
Avg. Total Value Insured	\$62,950,880	\$246,306,435		
Avg. Annual Deductible	\$11,111	\$28,125		
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 1.7%	Up 87.5% <sup>*</sup>		
Automobile Insurance				
Avg. Auto Insurance Premium for 2011	\$53,845	\$146,336		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 28.5%	Down 4.9%		
Avg. Annual Auto Insurance Deductible	\$7,650	\$22,500		
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Down 1.5%	Up 111.8% <sup>*</sup>		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> All results have been weighted from a sample size of between 97 and 122 municipalities representing approximately 50% of the Ontario population. With a 95% confidence limit, the results are accurate to within +/-7.42%. Premiums vary based on individual municipal claims history.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Premiums include all coverage from general liability, property and automobile insurance plus other coverage, including other liability insurance as well as environmental, transit, crime, aviation, and marine insurance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Includes coverage for annual aggregate commercial or comprehensive general liability insurance (including primary, umbrella and excess layers).

Deductible includes coverage for boiler and machinery.

Reflects changes in policy.



200 University Ave, Suite 801 Toronto, ON M5H 3C6 Tel.: (416) 971-9856 | Fax: (416) 971-6191

E-mail: amo@amo.on.ca

## Large Municipalities with Population of 75,000 and up

AUGUST 23, 2011

Survey Results for 2011 <sup>1</sup>	Municipalities with a population of 75,000-165,000	Municipalities with a population of 165,001+
Total Insurance Costs <sup>2</sup>		
Average Annual Insurance Premium for 2011	\$1,420,459	\$2,313,802
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 27.3%	Up 32.5%
Liability Insurance <sup>3</sup>		
Avg. Annual General Liability Insurance Premium for 2011	\$706,996	\$976,030
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 26.7%	Up 32.6%
Avg. Per Occurrence Deductible	\$177,778	\$584,444
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 3.2%	Up 5.5%
Avg. Total Annual Dollar Limit of Coverage	\$48,888,889	\$43,750,000
Property Insurance⁴		
Avg. Annual Property Insurance Premium for 2011	\$272,502	\$433,840
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 25.6%	Up 20.2%
Avg. Total Value Insured	\$476,847,515	\$1,467,506,942
Avg. Annual Deductible	\$150,556	\$548,333
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	No Change (0%)	Up 3.1%
Automobile Insurance		
Avg. Auto Insurance Premium for 2011	\$322,913	\$583,872
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 34%	Up 26.5%
Avg. Annual Auto Insurance Deductible	\$138,889	\$560,278
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 1.2%	Up 4%

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> All results have been weighted from a sample size of between 97 and 122 municipalities representing approximately 50% of the Ontario population. With a 95% confidence limit, the results are accurate to within +/-7.42%. Premiums vary based on individual municipal claims history.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Premiums include all coverage from general liability, property and automobile insurance plus other coverage, including other liability insurance as well as environmental, transit, crime, aviation, and marine insurance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Includes coverage for annual aggregate commercial or comprehensive general liability insurance (including primary, umbrella and excess layers).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Deductible includes coverage for boiler and machinery.



### **Upper Tier Municipalities**

Survey Results for 2011 <sup>1</sup>	Upper Tier Municipalities		
Total Insurance Costs <sup>2</sup>			
Average Annual Insurance Premiums for 2011	\$943,702		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 25.1%		
Liability Insurance <sup>3</sup>			
Avg. Annual General Liability Insurance Premiums for 2011	\$440,005		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 30.9%		
Avg. Per Occurrence Deductible	\$913,947		
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 0.8%		
Avg. Total Annual Dollar Limit of Coverage	\$28,684,737		
Property Insurance⁴			
Avg. Annual Property Insurance Premium	\$198,023		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 24%		
Avg. Total Value Insured	\$512,273,482		
Avg. Annual Deductible	\$102,632		
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 3%		
Automobile Insurance			
Avg. Annual Auto Insurance Premium for 2011	\$302,497		
Avg. % Change in Premiums since 2007	Up 20.1%		
Avg. Annual Auto Insurance Deductible	\$81,861		
Avg. % Change in Deductibles since 2007	Up 1.6%		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> All results have been weighted from a sample size of between 97 and 122 municipalities representing approximately 50% of the Ontario population. With a 95% confidence limit, the results are accurate to within +/-7.42%. Results for Upper Tier Municipalities include the Waterloo Region Municipalities Insurance Pool. Premiums vary based on individual municipal claims history.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Premiums include all coverage from general liability, property and automobile insurance plus other coverage, including other liability insurance as well as environmental, transit, crime, aviation, and marine insurance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Includes coverage for annual aggregate commercial or comprehensive general liability insurance (including primary, umbrella and excess layers).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Deductible includes coverage for boiler and machinery.

### Have questions about the premiums paid by your municipality?

#### Five things your municipality can do:

- **1. See how your local premiums compare.** Contrast your municipal premiums to the averages listed in this booklet. Keep in mind that this is only one point of reference. Claims history also plays a significant role in determining the premiums charged by insurers and were not part of this survey. Also, the types of facilities and services your community offers will likely differ over others and affect premiums.
- **2. Consider increasing deductibles.** The survey reveals municipal deductibles have remained generally unchanged in the past five years. Consider increasing your municipality's deductible as a way to reduce premiums. This means your municipality will be responsible for managing a greater degree of risk before insurance coverage begins. Discuss this with your insurance provider.
- **3. Review the dollar limits of your municipal liability coverage.** The survey reveals that over the past five years, the dollar limits of coverage have remained unchanged sector wide. With the increasing frequency and size of damage awards, discuss with your insurance provider the continued appropriateness of your municipality's exposure limits.
- **4. Continue to manage risk.** Help to reduce the possibility of claims being made against your municipality by following good risk management practices. More information is available on the Local Authority Services Limited website <a href="www.las.on.ca">www.las.on.ca</a>. Look for *Risk Management* under the *Administration Programs* heading.
- **5. Advocate for joint and several liability reform.** As "deep pocket" defendants with seemingly limitless public resources at their disposal through the power of taxation, municipalities have often become the targets of litigation when other defendants do not have the means to pay high damage awards. This reality is reflected in the insurance premiums paid by municipalities. Many common law jurisdictions have adopted reforms to restore the balance. Add your municipality's voice to the call for Ontario to do the same.

For information please contact Matthew Wilson, Senior Policy Advisor at <a href="mailto:mwilson@amo.on.ca">mwilson@amo.on.ca</a> or call 416-971-9856 extension 323.

August 23, 2011